

WHITEFISH ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE MINUTES

February 4, 2020

The meeting was called to order by Kathy Skemp at 8:18 AM

PRESENT: Stacy Caldwell, Shane Jacobs, Diane Kane, Paul McElroy, Kathy Skemp

ABSENT: Shaun Lewis, +1 vacant position

STAFF: Hilary Lindh

PUBLIC COMMENT: none.

APPOINTMENT OF VICE CHAIR: Shane Jacobs unanimously appointed.

MINUTES: The minutes from January 7, 2020 were unanimously approved.

OLD BUSINESS

Alpenglow Apartments – minor material change (ARC 19-02) The applicant described the proposed changes to what was approved in 2019. The applicant is proposing to use a natural finish stained 1x6 horizontal fir screen wall with minor spacing between the slats on the individual exterior screen walls of the decks/porches.

Kathy- only on balconies? Heather replies yes.

Shane- thinks it's a good change

Diane and Stacy – both think it's a good change

Motion:

Shane – move to accept the changes as submitted

Paul– 2nd

Discussion: none

Vote: passed unanimously

NEW BUSINESS

Whitefish School District, Maintenance and Receiving Facility, Timothy Peterson (ARC 20-01) The applicant described the project, location, site plan, materials.

Kathy – are the main entrance columns being painted? Applicant says they can be.

Shane – makes sense to tie the painting in from the main building, not just an application for the maintenance facility

Paul – do you have a south elevation of the maintenance facility? Yes

Shane – the colors match the new Muldown, do the sidings also match? Colors match but profiles are a little different.

Kathy – the rendering green is not the same as what is seen

Shane – fencing has slats around maintenance facility, what about around playground? No slats around playground.

Kathy – color of PVC fencing? Brown

Paul – fencing on 7th side? Existing chainlink as part of kindergarten. Will that change? Not part of maintenance project at this time – no new fence there. Back storage area won't really be visible.

Shane – a separate application for remaining buildings might be needed?

Kathy – also thinks it may need to be a separate submittal. Old building comes down in June.

Applicant – did want to show that bringing kindergarten into whole campus feel but real reason for maintenance facility

Kathy – chainlink and pvc fencing not preferred

Diane – pvc fencing doesn't weather well. Applicant – it's existing around school now. Lots of maintenance vehicles, etc.

Kathy – focus on maintenance building today, and we can come back to kindergarten later.

Paul – wish the original entrance could be saved. Doesn't love chainlink and pvc slats, but for industrial use probably good

Diane – color of pvc slats? Brown.

Kathy – where is equipment now? Behind high school.

Diane – maintenance for one school? Whole district.

Paul – equipment will be parked overnight in gated area? Yes, or inside building. Screening parking area with landscaping? Existing tree to left of driveway will remain.

Kathy – any other landscaping? Already a lot on slope down to Cow Creek? What about around fence area? Applicant – it's far back on property, not very visible. Maybe when know what's happening with kindergarten, could consider landscaping between the buildings. Applicant acknowledges.

Committee not sure if there's anything else that could be done to

Motion:

Shane – move to approve as submitted with recommendation that kindergarten be a separate application in future

Diane – 2nd

Discussion: none

Vote: passed unanimously

Lupfer Mixed Use, unaddressed Lupfer Avenue, Matt Lawrence Montana Creative (ARC 20-05) The applicant presented the project, location, context of the neighborhood, building, materials and landscaping. Lot is 25' wide, building will be 23' wide. Neighbors to the south will be affected. Discussed prevailing setbacks on street. Most are between

12-15' from property lines. Two alternatives presented for around front windows: aged copper or dark hunter green metal panel. If too cost prohibitive would go with dark paint on wood. Off-white plaster finish on second floor and parts of entry door. Rain screen panels for accents. Black window frames and rail.

Paul – would be good to have color rendering. Matt – the colors are off, but he will send it.

Shane – would help understand the planes with the different textures.

Kathy – agrees, hard to figure out without the verbal description. Most of east elevation of 3rd floor is glass? Yes. Rain screen with glass? Yes. Came for pre-application, correct? Yes. Because of Old Town character.

Shane – no door for garage? No, more of a carport. Also, tight turning radius. Any idea of tenants yet? Not yet. Can't do residential because of parking. Sidewalk to door – hardscape? Yes. Fire ratings for side walls – what considerations? One and 2-hour ratings, and all sprinkled. What about roof draining? Asphalt shingles to hold snow with small hangover for drip line. Probably wouldn't do gutters on sides, internal gutters for decks to catch basins.

Shane – alternate materials? Matt – they will go with green metal, but if switch to aged copper will bring it in. If a product change, will come back in. Who makes rain screen? Manufactured, not hand bent.

Kathy – timeline? Permit set February 12. Looking for official action now.

Diane – skinny space, given constraints it's a nice way to use space.

Paul – what are the lids again? Plaster to reflect natural light. I'd like to see it altogether as a rendering. Loves the uniqueness. Overhang would be good to keep water off the exterior walls.

Shane – form and scale look appropriate with modern twist on old gable. Would also like to see 3D rendering to visualize corners and north and south sides. And how existing buildings affect what's visible.

Stacy – does a nice job of fitting in and adding interest to street. Likes each of the colors but can't totally picture it without rendering. Would be comfortable with colors presented but wants to see rendering.

Kathy- really likes first floor finishes and whole design.

Motion:

Stacy – move to approve with materials provided, but with condition that committee see the 3D color rendering digital form

Shane– 2nd

Discussion: none

Vote: passed unanimously

6191 Hwy 93S commercial project, Aaron Wallace Montana Creative (ARC 20-02)
Described the project, neighborhood context, building, materials and vehicle circulation. Outside patio with wood fencing; wood landscaping fencing between car wash and

residents to east. Montana rustic theme with durable materials. Stone base with columns, lap siding and darker trim, shake siding above. Brown tones.

Kathy – patio fencing material? Wood fence, vertical with stone base.

Paul – know any history of the architecture of the building? No, just used as club house for golf course. Any improvements would be helpful.

Diane – is overhang on car wash really going to deflect sound? Aaron - will help along with landscaping, won't be zero sound.

Paul – unmanned car wash? Yes.

Shane – materials of the back wall facing residential? Aaron – same as front but without stone base.

Kathy – break up roofline a bit? Aaron - shed roof whole length is 60', so did not consider it. High windows look into mechanical space, opaque glass.

Stacy – green space and landscaping? Aaron - will be expanded on street side.

Shane – from north side, shared easement? South side shared with south, as well? Any changes to use could change queuing for coffee drive through. Aaron - easements in place for shared access. Landscaped median extends full width of lot.

Diane – landscaping on apartment sides? Aaron – there is also a grade change which will help buffer quite a bit.

Shane – proposed landscaping plan provided? Aaron – the final plan is not drawn up yet, but this is the main idea.

Stacy – landscaping for all setback? Yes.

Paul – full face lift on building? Aaron – yes, nothing existing for finish material. Possibly top 2 peak windows would stay. New fascia, new soffit, roof, windows, doors.

Kathy – why chimney on coffee kiosk and not restaurant? Aaron - there is one existing on restaurant building.

Stacy – pedestrian access? Aaron – sidewalk along highway, could look at sidewalk from highway to restaurant, but not sure better than going to parking lot. Could stripe walkway?

Aaron – the way the lots/buildings laid out makes it tough to safely get pedestrians to door.

Paul – lots of people living behind, would be nice to have access. Aaron – would need sidewalk on adjacent property. Dimension of materials? Scale of arch sign, will timber look puny? Aaron – timber should be good using 8' timbers. Monument signage will be designed, permitted later.

Kathy – arch to direct vehicles to car wash looks like ranch entrance.

Shane – stain on knee braces? Aaron – yes. Light fixtures?

Paul – car wash door materials? Aaron – darker color with transparent windows, more residential looking. Final selection not made yet. Not wood (maintenance issue), but as close to looking like wood as possible.

Kathy – may be too many unanswered questions to be approved today. Aaron – needs to move forward today.

Paul – sign and scale with timber dimensions, garage doors needed. Aaron – main timbers are 8"x8", sides are 6"x6".

Stacy – only discomfort is pedestrian access but since existing building okay with it.

Paul – concern over arch timbers, mass. But improvements would be much better than existing. Garage doors a concern.

Shane – mashing all the uses together is challenging, two uses are vehicular. Overall, site and building are improved. Would like to see lighting details and car wash doors before approving. Aaron – can bring back details once selected if necessary or if different from what he’s presented. Would propose a glass door on car wash.

Motion:

Shane – move to approve as presented with condition that change to glass doors for car wash building and light fixtures are dark sky compliant.

Stacy – 2nd

Discussion: none

Vote: passed 4-1 with Kathy against because there are a lot of details that should have been provided.

Riverview Meadows Apartments, Akers Lane, Aaron Wallace Montana Creative (ARC 20-04) Described the project, neighborhood context, building, materials and outdoor lighting. Had to make some changes in order to find more space for parking. Same color tones as townhomes to east.

Kathy – color of bike rack and dog fence? Bike rack not selected yet, dog fence will be green wired fence (pvc covered galvanized)

Shane – are there bollards as shown and are they lit? Aaron – they will not be in there. Only street and building lighting.

Shane – window finishes? Aaron – dark tone vinyl. Dark color for mechanical.

Kathy – soffits? Cedar color with venting strip.

Shane – sconces? As shown on details, not on rendering.

Kathy – accents at entries? Wood braces. Need that kind of accent somewhere else on building to help the single-shed roof appearance be more rustic.

Shane – One building plane from northeast and street views – needs to be broken up. Building is flat but material suggests something else. Should be some additional relief somewhere. If material represented the form it would be nice. Aaron – would be fairly easy to do, bumping out about a foot. Open to that change.

Paul – likes it. All asphalt shingles. Yes, in darker tones.

Stacy – likes building, good pedestrian spaces, landscaping plan trying to keep trees facing hotel good.

Motion:

Shane – move to approve as presented with suggestion to break up single plane with some relief.

Paul – 2nd

Discussion: none

Vote: passed unanimously

Triplex 715 W 2nd Street, Aaron Wallace Montana Creative (ARC 20-03) Described the project, neighborhood context, building, materials and outdoor lighting. Site is sloping up away from highway, so units will be staggered in setback from parking and height.

Stacy – is there an existing drive? There is one that needs to be improved.

Kathy – what is the fascia material? Black metal. See through railings on roof? Yes, wire for drainage. Edge treatments? Trim profile in same metal.

Paul – how do you explain corners? There are corner pieces available, painted.

Shane – detail reflects more modern, simple design. Nice. Roof hatches on exterior stair? Really want that to pop up? Aaron – insulate so outdoor spaces can be enclosed in future, but if snow falls through hatch could cause problems.

Diane – nice design, setback from highway with lots of mature trees. Aaron – they plan to keep as many as possible. Will help buffer neighbors.

Paul – would be nice if corners could be mitered. Not a fan of corner pieces. Discussion on type of corners, external vs. internal pieces. External pieces can fall off. Internal pieces are preferred.

Stacy – good fit for neighborhood.

Paul – pour window wells? Yes.

Kathy – question about building height and if future owners enclose roof patio. Clarified.

Stacy – Hatch is also a nice privacy benefit.

Kathy – lighting dark sky compliant? Aaron – it will be. Roof to be used over wall sconce that shines both up and down.

Paul – like roof top and hatch. What's height of wall between patios? 3' only due to building height limitation. Will that screen furniture? Unlikely to be able to see from highway.

Motion:

Shane – move to approve as presented

Paul – 2nd

Discussion: none

Vote: passed unanimously

Whitefish Starbucks, 6405 Highway 93 S, Ron Nash, Montana Creative (ARC 20-06) With owner Mark Waatti. Described the project, neighborhood context, building, materials and outdoor lighting.

Kathy – signage part of sign regulation? Yes – will conform.

Diane – access? Ron – there will be a new driveway and the owner is hoping to have an agreement with the mall for connected parking lots.

Paul – soffit or exterior lid material? Will match siding.

Kathy – did you consider using vertical wood instead of the corrugated metal? Ron – wanted material that is durable. Material with warmth down at human scale, but lower maintenance material up high. Normally committee doesn't like metal siding. Ron – meeting intent with material at lower level for human scale.

Paul – commercial application of charwood? Ron – it doesn't have the longevity of metal but does have a 10-year life span. What will it look like in a year or two? Ron – they have been happy with how it weathers in other locations.

Stacy – loves that the east elevation is so welcoming. Looks like hedge being used to block entry from sidewalk? Ron – there is not path right now crossing from sidewalk to street entry but could open up the uninterrupted landscaping.

Shane – likes how building is oriented to highway, and how drive-thru and parking in back. Acknowledges there is a struggle with having two front doors. How do you navigate as a pedestrian from parking lot, patio, etc.

Kathy – what about pedestrian access from mall? Timeline on construction? March for construction, open by September. Ron – they would love to be able to move forward with conditions, if needed.

Stacy – nice design and not standard franchising, likes elements pulled in to feel like Whitefish.

Shane – floor plans show kitchen but not rest of plan. No use of vestibules? No. Clerestory windows real? Real. Wall sconces – are they drawn at correct height? Ron – they are probably a foot low, should match the top of the door. The kitchen equipment/mechanical – is it screened sufficiently given height? Ron – doesn't know if the mechanics are completely screened, should be 75% for sure. They don't have a Class A hood or anything, so minimal. Will only have two HVAC units and a bathroom fan, so should be lower profile.

Shane – Truss/bracket detail is “Whitefish” formula, since comes from Firebrand. Could you figure out a different method rather than recycling another project? Ron is happy to look at changing design of those to see if something else would work better.

Paul – likes the brackets and doesn't think they should be removed. Likes the truss with the dark lid. Facia material? Patio surface? Just grey concrete. Paul likes all the materials.

Diane – appreciates the effort to make it non-standard franchise. Nice small building and materials.

Paul – is parking and drive-thru designed to bare minimums regarding radii, drive aisles, etc.? Mark – pretty tight based on site limitations and city regulations. No potential for retaining wall? Ron – there is a retaining wall facing the pond. Will be terraced with iron block, no rail to be used. Drawing brought to meeting (added to folder), not submitted earlier.

Kathy – nice looking, biggest concern is pedestrian access. Ron – they can make sure that happens.

Shane would like to see canopy supports/brackets revised.

Motion:

Shane – move to approve the project with the conditions that bracket design be revised and pedestrian access from highway sidewalk be provided.

Diane – 2nd

Discussion: none

Vote: passed unanimously

OTHER ITEMS

Council Directed Amendments Diane, Kathy, Wendy met a few weeks ago to determine how many sketches versus photos. Wendy sent those to David Koel, Cushing Terrel to get a cost estimate.

Status of Shaun Lewis unknown – Wendy to follow up with him. He may have left town, taken new position.

Meeting adjourned at 11:06 AM